The Challenges of Epidemiological Modelling of the COVID-19 Pandemic

BBS Meeting
July 27, 2021

Thierry Van Effelterre
Janssen
Disclaimer:

This presentation is intended for informational purposes only. The information, views and opinions expressed in this presentation are those of the presenter and, unless stated expressly to the contrary, are not necessarily those of Janssen Pharmaceutica NV or its affiliates (“Janssen”). Janssen cannot guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this presentation. Neither Janssen nor any person acting on behalf of Janssen may be held responsible for the use which may be made of the information contained in this presentation.
Context

• Transmission models of infectious diseases very useful to
  • better understand population-level dynamics of infectious diseases
  • project future epidemiology under different interventions and “scenarios”
• Unprecedented number of transmission models developed during COVID-19 pandemic.
• More exposure of general public to transmission models than ever before.
• Great implications of model projections world-wide:
  • plan health care management (e.g. hospital occupancy)
  • inform decision makers about mandates and policies (lockdown, social distancing, ...)
  • inform general public about future evolution of the pandemic
• Challenging:
  • fast moving
  • still much uncertainty

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Aim of this presentation

• Present key aspects of epidemiological transmission models, illustrated with COVID-19.

  The models presented are for illustration purpose. No ambition to be exhaustive here!

• Highlight a few challenges to make middle-to-long term projections.

• This presentation is NOT aiming at
  • presenting model projections
  • discussing validation of model projections.

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Type of models

• **Forecast vs Prediction**
  
  • Forecast models: shorter term – often more of statistical/probabilistic type.
  • Prediction in middle-to-longer term: require to account for “mechanistic” aspects.

• **Focus here is on “mechanistic” models**, they can be
  
  • “Compartmental”
  • Agent-based (ABM) model, microsimulations, ...

In this presentation we will illustrate with compartmental models but many key aspects may hold true for ABM models as well.
Key features of mechanistic transmission models

• Natural history of the infection/disease

• Transmission
  • The Force of Infection
  • The Basic reproduction number

• Heterogeneities

• Modelling interventions: non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPI’s), vaccination

• Data & models

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Compartmental models

• The compartmental structure represents the natural history of the infection

• Key features of compartmental transmission models:

  ➢ **Compartments:** represent different infection/disease states in which individuals can be.
    • model states are mutually exclusive.
    • number of individuals in a given compartment is a prevalence

  ➢ **Flows:** represent transitions between compartments (states) over time,
    • characterized by per-capita flowing rates between compartments.

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
COVID-19 models are of the “SEIRS” type

FOI: “Force of infection”
- $p_I$: percentage of infections symptomatic
- $d_E$: mean duration of exposed
- $d_A$: mean duration infectiousness asymptomatic
- $d_I$: mean duration infectiousness symptomatic
- $d_R$: mean duration of natural immunity

Model states (compartments)
- S: susceptible to be infected
- E: exposed (latent) - Infected & not yet infectious
- A: infected & infectious but Asymptomatic
- I: infected & infectious and Symptomatic
- R: recovered

COVID-19 related deaths
- $8 = (1 - p_I) \times \frac{1}{d_E} \times E$
- $p_I \times \frac{1}{d_E} \times E$
- $\frac{1}{d_A} \times A$
- $\frac{1}{d_I} \times I$
- $\frac{1}{d_R} \times R$

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
The "force of infection" (FOI) is the per susceptible rate to be infected. The FOI is at the core of the non-linear population dynamics of infectious diseases.

\[ \text{FOI} = t \times c \times \frac{I}{N} \]

- \( t \): transmission rate per contact per unit of time
- \( c \): mean number of contacts of an individual
- \( I \): number of infectious individuals
- \( N \): total population

\[ \text{incidence of new infections} = \text{FOI} \times S \]

- The Basic reproduction number (\( R_0 \)) is a key quantity, defined as the mean number of new infections generated by one infectious individual in a fully susceptible population.

\[ R_0 = t \times c \times d \]

- \( t \) and \( c \) as above
- \( d \): mean duration of infectiousness

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Heterogeneities for COVID-19

• **Age:**
  • *Who has contact with whom* shown to be age-dependent through contact survey studies (e.g. Polymod study in the EU): relevant for person-to-person transmission in general.
  • Severity of disease: risk of disease and severity age-dependent.
  • Death (Case fatality rate and Infection fatality rate) strongly age-dependent.

• **Location:**
  • Countries
  • Regions (e.g. Different policies in different provinces)
  • **Underlying conditions, comorbidities**
  • SARS-COV-2 variants
  • Vaccine acceptance
  • Socio-economic status
  • ...

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Contact between age groups

Empirical studies (e.g. Polymod contact survey, Mossong et al, 2008)
- can inform “who as contact with whom” between age groups.
- have shown:
  - important assortativity of contacts: more contact with people of similar age.
  - more contacts in younger people.
  - difference between countries
  - quite similar general pattern though.

More recently: models of contacts based on empirical data have been developed for many countries (e.g. Prem et al, 2017, in 152 countries)

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
The force of infection revisited

Heterogeneity of contacts between age groups can be accounted for with contact matrices:

\[ FOI_i = t \sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{ij} \frac{I_j}{N_j} \]

- \( t \): transmission rate per contact per unit of time
- \( c_{ij} \): mean number of contacts of individuals of age \( i \) with individuals of age \( j \)
- \( I_j \): number of infectious individuals of age \( j \)
- \( N_j \): population of age \( j \)

One way to model Non-pharmaceutical Interventions (NPI’s):
- use setting-specific contact matrices (home, school, work, others). See for example: Prem et al, 2017.
- reduce transmission by setting over time (see for examples: Davies et al, 2020, Abrams et al, 2021)

\[ FOI_i = t \sum_{j=1}^{N} \left( w_H(t) c_{ij}^H + w_S(t) c_{ij}^S + w_W(t) c_{ij}^W + w_O(t) c_{ij}^O \right) \frac{I_j}{N_j} \]

\( c_{ij}^H, c_{ij}^S, c_{ij}^W, c_{ij}^O \): mean number contacts between age \( i \) and age \( j \) at home (H), school (S), work (W), other settings (O)
\( w_H(t), w_S(t), w_W(t), w_O(t) \): time-varying weights decreasing transmission by setting.

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Challenges related to transmission

• The transmission usually estimated (derived) from the \textit{basic reproduction number}. Estimates of $R_0$ available since beginning of the pandemic, but projections may have to account for evolution in transmissibility (e.g. new SARS-COV-2 variants)

• Modeling NPI’s very challenging:
  
  • time-varying

  • same NPI’s may have different effects in different countries wrt “compliance” (e.g. China vs U.S.)

  • uncertainty about potential NPI’s in the future

\textbf{Disclaimer:} The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
In order to estimate some model parameters or to refine them, most models need to be calibrated to observed population-level data.

Type of data used for calibration for COVID-19: cases, hospitalizations, deaths, ...

- **COVID-19 cases:**
  - only tested cases are reported (different testing strategies in different countries)
  - fewer asymptomatic infections are reported
  - also substantial under-ascertainment of symptomatic cases, which is time- and country/region-specific

- **COVID-19 hospitalizations**

- **COVID-19 deaths**: usually more reliable, but not everywhere

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Under-ascertainment of COVID-19 symptomatic cases

Case reports under-estimate true burden of symptomatic infections:

Model-based estimation (Russell et al, 2020)

Estimated under-ascertainment:
- solid: median
- blue band: 95% CI
Dashed: new tests per new case

From Russell et al, BMC Medicine, 2020

Estimated percentage of symptomatic cases reported
Examples in 9 different countries

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
To what extent are COVID-19 under-reported?

Excess mortality: difference in total number of deaths in a crisis compared to those expected under normal conditions.

As an example: IHME estimates 7.1 million COVID-19 deaths by May 13, 2021, which is more than 2 x higher than reported number of deaths (3.33 million).


Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Using deaths counts for model calibration

- Many models calibrated on deaths counts (and/or hospitalizations)
- **Deaths related to infections through estimates of the Infection fatality rate** (IFR) = percentage of COVID-19 infections that lead to COVID-19 deaths
- IFR is strongly age-specific
- Calibration of deaths projected by a model to deaths counts allows to estimate all infections

**Log10 (IFR) vs Age**

**IFR vs Age**

From Levin et al, European Journal of Epidemiology, 2020

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Modeling vaccination

Vaccines can potentially have multiple effects:

• **direct effect on disease** (primary endpoint in vaccine trials)
  • Could be different on different levels of severity

• **reduce the force of infection:**
  • Can generate additional *herd protection* (indirect) effects

• **reduce infectiousness if nevertheless infected**
  • Can generate additional *herd protection* (indirect) effects

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Model without vaccination

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Model with vaccination

S
Susceptible

E
Exposed/Latent

I
Symptomatic

R
Recovered

SV
Susceptible

EV
Exposed/Latent

IV
Symptomatic

AV
Asymptomatic

RV
Recovered

\[(1 - E_i) \times \text{FOI} \times S\]

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Potential effects of vaccines

- **S** Susceptible
- **E** Exposed/Latent
- **A** Asymptomatic
- **I** Symptomatic
- **R** Recovered
- **SV** Susceptible
- **EV** Exposed/Latent
- **AV** Asymptomatic
- **IV** Symptomatic
- **RV** Recovered

Diagram:

1. **S** to **E** with label: \((1 - E_i) \times FOI \times S\)
2. **E** to **SV** with label: Effect of vaccine on infection (reduces the FOI)
3. **S** to **A**
4. **E** to **A**
5. **S** to **I**
6. **E** to **I**
7. **S** to **R**
8. **E** to **R**
9. **A** to **AV**
10. **I** to **IV**
11. **AV** to **RV**
12. **IV** to **RV**

**Disclaimer:** The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Potential effects of vaccines

- **S** (Susceptible)
- **E** (Exposed/Latent)
- **I** (Symptomatic)
- **R** (Recovered)
- **SV** (Susceptible)
- **EV** (Exposed/Latent)
- **AV** (Asymptomatic)
- **IV** (Symptomatic)

**Mathematical Formulas:**

\[
(1 - E_i) \cdot \text{FOI} \cdot S
\]

**Pathways:**

- **Blue:** non-vaccinated states
- **Green:** vaccinated states

**Effects:**

- Effect of vaccine on infection (reduces the FOI)
- Effect of vaccine on disease if infected

**Disclaimer:** The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Challenges related to modelling vaccination

• Preliminary data indicates COVID-19 vaccines also have the potential to reduce the risk to be infected and infectiousness if infected, which can generate indirect “herd protection” effects.

  Primary endpoint of trials on disease. Desirable to have more data to estimate those other important outcomes as well.

• Duration of vaccine protection not well known yet (need longer follow-up), with subsequent impact on modelling re-vaccination strategies

• Effects of vaccines against new variants might need periodic re-assessments.

• Uncertainties about who will be vaccinated and vaccination coverage in the future:
  • Target populations
  • Vaccine availability
  • Different vaccines with different characteristics (number of doses, efficacies, ...)
  • Vaccine acceptance.

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
Conclusions

• Transmission models useful to better understand the dynamics of the COVID-19 pandemic and project potential future epidemiology under different scenarios/strategies.

• Several challenges though:
  
  • Reliability of epidemiological data needed for model calibration
  
  • Model NPI’s over time.
  
  • Uncertainties about natural history, e.g. duration of natural immunity and future evolution of transmissibility with new variants
  
  • Quantify effects of vaccine, not only on disease but also on infection and infectiousness
  
  • Uncertainties about duration of vaccine protection.

Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.
References


Disclaimer: The views, information or opinions expressed during this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent those of Janssen.